

Human Resource Management Strategy for Handling Turnover Using a Design Thinking Approach

Nurkholis Alfian¹, Ellya Zulaikha², Mohamad Yusak Anshori³

^{1,2,3}Institut Teknologi Sepuluh November, Surabaya, Indonesia

*nurkholisalfian.ind@gmail.com*¹

Abstract

A startup company must have resilience in facing various challenges, including operational issues such as employee turnover. Human Resource Management (HRM) plays a crucial role in controlling the activities and operational productivity of the company. This research aims to identify employee responses and the causes of issues related to human resources problems (employee turnover) in the company. The method used in this research employs the Design Thinking approach, which involves the stages of empathy, define, ideate, prototype, and test. The empathy stage is conducted by gaining a deeper understanding of the problem through situation analysis, questionnaire surveys, and interviews. In the define stage, the identification of in-depth problem exploration results in the formulation of a point of view on the problem, and questions are created to explore as many ideas as possible. The accumulated ideas are then selected through DOT voting to choose the best idea. The selected idea in this study is a mental health program for employees expected to reduce employee turnover rates. The resulting prototype is a meditation program for employees. Testing the program yields satisfying feedback, with employees enjoying and feeling their well-being accommodated by the company. Therefore, this program can enhance employee productivity and foster a healthy mind and soul.

Keywords: *Design Thinking, Mental Health, Startup, Turnover*

Abstrak

Perusahaan startup harus memiliki ketangguhan dalam menghadapi berbagai tantangan, termasuk permasalahan operasional seperti turnover karyawan. Manajemen sumber daya manusia (SDM) memiliki peran penting dalam mengontrol aktivitas dan produktivitas operasional perusahaan. Penelitian bertujuan untuk mengidentifikasi respon karyawan dan penyebab permasalahan terhadap permasalahan sumber daya manusia (turnover karyawan) pada perusahaan. Metode pada penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan Design Thinking. Pendekatan design thinking dilakukan dari tahapan empathy, define, ideate, prototype dan test. Tahap empathy dilakukan dengan memahami lebih dalam permasalahan melalui analisis situasi,

melakukan survei kuisisioner dan wawancara. Pada define dilakukan identifikasi dari hasil pendalaman masalah, sehingga menghasilkan point of view permasalahan dan dibuatkan pertanyaan (how might we) untuk menggali ideasi sebanyak-banyaknya. Ide yang telah terkumpul akan dilakukan pemilihan ide terbaik melalui DOT Voting. Ideasi yang akhirnya terpilih dalam penelitian ini adalah program kesehatan mental untuk karyawan yang diharapkan dapat menurunkan tingkat turnover karyawan. Prototipe yang dihasilkan adalah program meditasi karyawan. Hasil pengujian program menghasilkan umpan balik yang memuaskan, dimana karyawan menikmati dan merasakan kesejahteraan mereka diakomodir oleh perusahaan. Sehingga program ini dapat meningkatkan produktivitas karyawan dan membangun pikiran dan jiwa yang sehat.

Keywords: Design Thinking, Mental Health, Startup, Turnover

INTRODUCTION

Human resources have an important role in achieving a company's goals (Gustiana et al., 2022). However, many companies face challenges not only in recruiting employees but also in retaining them with the company. This is considered a problem because companies will need additional energy and time to look for new employees, as well as allowing these new employees to reach levels of productivity that can hinder the achievement of company goals (Waldman et al, 2004). Moreover, when employees leave the company, this can have a negative impact, both for the employee and the company itself. Turnover refers to an employee's decision to leave the organization where they work. Although there are situations where turnover can benefit an organization, in general, turnover is considered detrimental to the organization or company. According to Robbins & Judge (2009) defines turnover as an employee's action to end their employment relationship permanently, which can occur either of their own volition or without their will. Turnover can involve resignation, movement

out of an organizational unit, dismissal, or even the death of an organizational member. Turnover is closely related to job satisfaction (Medina, 2012). Therefore, organizations are making serious efforts to increase employee job satisfaction levels, in the hope of reducing their desire to turnover.

According to Friani & Mulyani (2018), currently the turnover rate among millennial generation employees has increased significantly, and this can be a serious threat to companies because it has the potential to have both financial and non-financial impacts and can be detrimental to company performance. One of the factors that can cause this increase in turnover is the imbalance between work demands and personal life, especially for millennial generation employees (Schaefer, 2017). Therefore, companies need to pay serious attention to factors that have the potential to cause failure. One potential cause of this failure is human resource management. To overcome these risks, effective human resource management is needed. Studies show that millennial and Generation Z have special needs in the workplace, including the desire for

challenging and meaningful work, flexibility, and balance between work and personal life (Schaefer, 2017). Balance between work and life plays an important role in helping Company employees manage work tasks, personal lives and family responsibilities. An imbalance in the balance between work and life can cause high levels of stress and increase the desire to change jobs (Jha, 2014).

Recently, the millennial and Z generations are being attracted to the lure of casual style work, where the casual style gives employees freedom when carrying out their duties. Some elements of this casual style include freedom of clothing, flexibility in working hours, and the option to work from various locations such as home or the office. This factor is the main attraction for new graduates and young workers to join and work in startup companies (Rahayu, 2018). Meanwhile, on the other hand, the challenges faced by employees in startup companies involve factors such as inadequate salaries and work benefits, an organizational structure that is still in the process of being formed so that employees carry out several tasks at once, instability in company income, and continuous evolution in work culture. Startup companies have work dynamics that are very changing and full of uncertainty (Bussgang, 2017).

PT. XYZ is a startup company engaged in Aquaculture Technology (Aquatech) and is only 2 years old, experiencing a turnover rate since the last 1 year, with a turnover figure of 96.3% in the first year of the company. Based on the exit interview results obtained from PT. XYZ, it

was revealed that several factors were the reasons why employees chose to leave work. As many as 50% of employees decided to change jobs because they received an offer from another company, 30% opened a business, and 20% cited personal reasons. In early 2023, the results of the interim evaluation of the majority of employees consider that PT. XYZ is considered unstable, working odd jobs and lacking adequate benefits. Based on the phenomena explained in the background, it is important for PT. XYZ to overcome high turnover rates, especially ensuring employees can survive and feel at home in the company. Therefore, an innovative empathy-based approach is needed for human Resource Management (HR), so it is necessary to use a design thinking approach to help startup companies PT. XYZ and the like in identifying company problems and finding innovative solutions to improve performance, employee satisfaction and reduce high turnover rates.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Turnover refers to the tendency or intention of an employee to leave his job voluntarily or move to another workplace according to his personal choice. Turnover involves a series of psychological processes that lead to the actual act of moving, starting from evaluating the current job, experiencing emotional experiences such as satisfaction or dissatisfaction, considering quitting, evaluating alternative job opportunities, intention to look for alternatives, search for alternatives, evaluation of related alternatives, comparison between jobs alternatives and current work, up to the final decision to quit or remain working in the current position (Belete, 2018). The

essence of this model is the existence of cognitive and behavioral manifestations that arise due to emotional experiences of the level of job satisfaction or dissatisfaction, which can ultimately lead to withdrawal from work (Moble, 1986). Job satisfaction is an emotional condition where a person feels positive or negative regarding their work (Kurniawaty et al., 2019). Job satisfaction reflects individual feelings towards their work, employees' attitudes towards work, and the work culture where they work. Work environment factors that contribute to job satisfaction involve placement, treatment received, positive work environment conditions, and achievement of set goals (Lis et al., 2022). Job satisfaction is a crucial indicator because it measures employees' feelings towards their job and the organization where they work. A high level of job satisfaction can encourage employee loyalty to the company. On the other hand, low levels of job satisfaction can create discomfort, worry, and increase the possibility of employees leaving their jobs (Febriansyah & Ginting, 2020).

Work-life balance is an approach to work that emphasizes the importance of balancing aspects of work, personal, family, spiritual and social life. Employees who can achieve this balance are considered capable of serving themselves, their work, their families, God and social lives (Oludayo & Omonijo, 2020). Work-life balance involves a person's ability to maintain a balance of responsibilities at work and outside work (Rizqiana, 2020). Therefore, an effective work-life balance policy in companies is considered the key to reducing stress, turnover, as well as

having a positive impact on job satisfaction, productivity and employee retention (Sarjana & Silalahi, 2022). In the startup business realm, it is emphasized that human resource planning and management have a very significant role in running the business operations. The presence of diverse employees encourages companies to develop regulations that suit the characteristics of each individual. Considering the uncertainty of the business environment which is reflected in fluctuating market dynamics and intense competition, as well as continuous innovation in technology, processes and products, a crucial step for startup companies is to make decisions to make breakthroughs in various fields. These breakthroughs can include innovations in the fields of technology, business models, cultural aspects and education, while determining the innovation strategy that best suits existing market conditions (Kamuriwo et al., 2017). Breakthroughs within the Company, especially in maintaining psychological conditions, performance and harmony between employees, must be carried out with innovation and regular refreshments as well. The development of innovation and creative problem solving can come from every individual in the company. According to Brown (2018) design thinking is an innovative, human-oriented approach adopted from design methods to unite individual needs, technological potential, and the requirements necessary for business success. One of the design thinking methods is from the Stanford D. School which comes from the Five Steps Design Thinking (FSDT) Model developed by the Hasso-Plattner Institute of Design at the Stanford Design School (D. School). Stanford

D. School is known as a leading academic institution that places importance on teaching design thinking. FSDT according to D. School has five stages as follows: empathize, define, ideate, prototype, and test (Doorley, 2018).

The empathize or empathy stage is to gain a deep understanding of the users or stakeholders who will be the focus of the design solution. Through empathy, design teams strive to see the world from the user's perspective, relate to their experiences, and understand their needs, challenges, and expectations. By understanding in depth, the team can better define the problem and ensure that the solution developed is truly relevant and meaningful to users. Empathy also helps build emotional connections between designers and users, resulting in more human and user-focused solutions. The define or identification stage aims to clearly and specifically formulate the problem or challenge to be solved and collect all the information obtained at the empathy stage. Then it is analyzed to find out the main problems that occur. This stage will also help design thinkers in creating great ideas that make it possible to solve problems. The ideate or idea stage is to produce as many creative ideas as possible that can be used as material to overcome the problems or challenges that have been set in the define stage. The main focus at this stage is to develop a diversity of ideas and possible solutions, without judging or filtering ideas too early.

The prototype stage aims to transform the ideas generated at the Ideate stage into a concrete and testable form. The main focus at this stage is to create a physical or visual representation of the proposed solution. The

resulting prototype does not need to have a high level of perfection, because in the next process, the prototype will undergo testing. The team is expected to be able to find solutions to every problem that arises during prototype testing, so that it can produce a superior and better quality prototype. Testing is the final stage in design thinking. The purpose of the test phase is to evaluate the effectiveness and usability of the prototype that was created in the previous phase. Prototype testing is carried out by involving users or relevant stakeholders to gather feedback and deeper understanding of how the proposed solution can meet their needs. The results of this trial can help the team identify the strengths and weaknesses of the prototype, as well as provide the insight needed to make improvements and improvements. Thus, the testing stage is key to validating ideas and ensuring that the resulting solution meets the desired goals.

METHOD

The method used in this research is a qualitative descriptive research type. Qualitative descriptive research is a research method that aims to understand a phenomenon or context in depth. This approach focuses on the interpretation, understanding and context of an event or symptom, without using numerical or statistical measurements taken from a collection of information originating from interviews or direct observations in the field of the problem being researched (Winartha, 2006). The data used in this research is primary data with the subjects being employees of PT. XYZ went through an interview process. This research applies an analysis method using a design thinking approach. The design

thinking approach is considered an approach that can produce innovative solutions by involving standard stages. The aim of this approach is to develop ideas, which are then realized in prototype form, with the hope that they can effectively overcome the problems faced (Madanih et al., 2019). Apart from that, the use of design thinking in a business context has the potential to produce creative ideas and effective solutions in overcoming the problems being faced (Martin, 2009). The design thinking stages will be carried out in 5 (five) stages, namely Empathize, Define, Ideate, Prototype, and Test. The five stages are expected to produce the best and most tested solutions so that it is ensured that the solution or program produced is in accordance with the user's needs and preferences.

RESULT

Startup companies are synonymous with dynamic work and rely on creativity, which requires startup employees to spend a lot of energy and thought and work excessively. Therefore, it is not uncommon for employees to become impatient and move in and out of startup companies. Startup Company PT. XYZ is currently carrying out activities using offline and online work systems. This startup company, which is only 2 years old, has experienced a high turnover rate since the last year, namely 96.3%. Where in 2022, a total of 13 people will leave and 18 people will enter, with an average total employee that year of 12 people. Dynamics of problems in startup companies PT. XYZ requires an innovative, empathy-based approach to human resource management (HR), so a design thinking approach needs to

be used. Design thinking plays a role in creating product innovations, solutions and developing innovative behavior and capabilities at the organizational and individual levels (Rösch & Tiberius, 2023). The following is the design thinking process carried out at PT. XYZ:

Empathize, this stage aims to gain the broadest possible empathetic understanding of the problems faced by PT. XYZ through questionnaire surveys and interviews with company employees. The results of the questionnaire survey and interviews were obtained as follows: first, at the survey stage with respondents consisting of 7 men and 1 woman, results were obtained where 50% of respondents felt satisfied with the company and respectively 25% of respondents felt dissatisfied and another 25% declared neutral. 75% of employees like the company because of the work environment and 25% because of the development opportunities. However, 50% of employees do not believe that there are career developments opportunities in the company, 50% also say they are rarely treated fairly and 62.5% also rarely receive recognition at work. However, 62.5% of employees stated that they were satisfied with the workload they received and provided input that the company could improve, namely in the salary/benefits and employee welfare sectors. Second, in this interview stage, the author tries to explore deeper needs in order to obtain information or things that could not be revealed previously through a questionnaire by interviewing 6 sources consisting of 3 managers and 3 staff. From the 6 sources, important points were obtained from each source, including: Interviewee 1, wants a competitive salary and benefits match for employees, an inclusive and

effective leadership culture, employee boredom and stress levels are reduced, employee skills are increased and things that make employees feel at home in the company environment. Furthermore, resource person 2 wants a balance in salary and productivity, openness in communication, evaluation of program effectiveness, building a healthy, productive and collaborative atmosphere and sustainable team development. Furthermore, resource person 3 wants additional employees to suit the needs of the team, open sharing sessions between employees and management, evaluate communication skills between employees, teams and the community, build team balance and build team cohesion that is productive and competent. Furthermore, resource person 4 wants efficiency in financial processes and targeted use of budgets, solutions in managing financial risks, designing effective and appropriate budgets, open discussions regarding financial conditions and building employee welfare programs. Furthermore, resource person 5 wants technological solutions to improve performance, build systems that are practical, attractive and easy to use, effective solutions to challenging problems, build a fun and flexible environment, refresh and control mental health to increase team productivity. Finally, resource person 6 wants efficiency in the auction process, strategies to increase auction participation and profits, build public trust regarding company programs, communication training, marketing, comparative studies, and a mental health program for employees.

Define, the results of the empathize stage will be analyzed at the define stage. At

this stage, the problem is defined as a problem statement that is centered on the persona that has been selected and efforts are made to achieve a problem identification process that is centered on user needs. The result at the define stage is the Point of View (POV) or the common thread of the empathy process carried out. The POVs obtained include, (1) Maintaining Competitive Salaries, (2) Creating an Inclusive Leadership Culture, (3) Improving Employee Welfare, (4) Providing Required Skills and Tiered Training, (5) Implementing Flexible Work Policies, (6) Offer Rewards Based on Performance, (7) Workload Balance and (8) Attention and Mental Well-Being. Based on this POV, eight main keys are obtained which are the basic ingredients in forming ideation, but before carrying out ideation, it is necessary to carry out the HMW (How Might We) stage to make it easier to produce quality and appropriate ideas.

Ideate, after successfully defining the problem and getting a point of view, the next process is the ideate stage. Ideas are obtained by brainstorming with the team by answering HMW from the POV that has been obtained previously. All ideas are accommodated to solve problems. The resulting ideas will become input for HRD to execute these ideas so that they can be applied to the company. In this research, so many ideas were generated that it was necessary to eliminate them using the DOT Voting method. The best and most relevant ideas will be selected through selecting ideas with DOT Voting so that the selected ideation options will become prototypes in the application program by the HRD team to employees. Ideas that have been eliminated in stage one will enter the advanced

ideation stage which will narrow down the ideas into one main idea which will be implemented into a prototype. It is possible that this idea can be combined or merged into an idea program concept that is applicable and produces a good impact on employees in the future. The final ideation decision that will be used as a prototype is to provide mental health programs such as counseling, meditation sessions, or entertainment to provide support and help employees manage stress. This program is expected to reduce high turnover, it is not always done with money (large salaries) but can be done in other ways, such as conducting employee welfare programs.



Figure 1. Prototype of Employee Meditation Program

In Figure 1, the program concept uses service design as a strategic approach in designing and developing human resource activity programs to be implemented in companies and society. Service design will place users as the main focus in designing activity programs. This principle will involve a deep understanding of program needs, motivations, and goals in order to create relevant and beneficial experiences for employees. This program starts with employees receiving notifications via WhatsApp, Gcall or Telegram. Employees go to the office and take attendance, after which the employees are directed to the meditation room. Employees will be asked to be silent

and begin the meditation process for 15-30 minutes. After that, the employees will be played with relaxing music that refreshes the soul, and then continue with a session of looking at each other and releasing all emotions by shouting together. Next, employees will tell stories to each other and give each other feedback. After that there will be a meal together and prayer together. The program ended with greetings of forgiving one another and returning to their respective activities with a calm, fresh and comfortable mind.

Testing is the final stage of the design thinking method. At this stage, the results that have been made are tested to find out feedback from employees. Program testing was carried out using role play and feedback capture grid. The program is simulated using role play, playing the role of a user or program participant, the testing team can better understand the interactions and reactions that may occur. Through role play, the testing team can experience directly the feelings, worries or happiness that program participants may feel. This helps increase the level of empathy towards users' needs and experience of the programs created. After the simulation, a feedback capture grid can be carried out to capture feedback from program users more systematically or after tests as follows:

1. Likes:
 - Participants liked the calm atmosphere created during office meditation sessions.
 - Many report that they experience health benefits, including reduced stress and increased focus.
 - Participants liked the flexibility of

the timing of the meditation sessions (before work activities) which allowed them to participate without disrupting their work schedules.

2. Wishes:

- Some participants wished there was more variety in the meditation techniques taught.
- Hope for a special meditation spot in the office that allows them to meditate at any time.
- Desire for thematic meditation sessions, such as meditation to increase creativity or manage conflict.

3. Questions:

- Some participants had questions about how often meditation sessions would be held in the office.
- Questions about how meditation can impact work productivity and team interactions.

4. Ideas:

- The idea to organize more in-depth meditation workshops to provide a better understanding of meditation techniques.
- Ideas for more interactive meditation sessions, involving discussion and exchange of experiences after the session.
- The idea of organizing joint meditation sessions with the team to strengthen relationships.

The follow-up to the table is: first, the team will arrange variations of meditation sessions and consider more flexible duration options. Second, various timings will be evaluated, and guidance on the benefits of meditation will be provided in the next information session. Third, thematic meditation sessions and meditation workshops will be considered as program

development. By applying a design thinking approach, the results of testing with 2 stages of testing concluded that reducing the company's turnover rate is expected to be successfully achieved through implementing mental health programs for employees. This solution proves that solutions are not always needed by providing large salaries because the company is experiencing financial problems, but rather by creating a healthy and comfortable work environment, which in the end can improve employee welfare and reduce labor turnover rates.

CONCLUSION

In this dynamic startup business, it is emphasized that human resource planning and management have a very significant role in carrying out business operations. So, the presence of diverse employees encourages companies to be able to control, develop and maintain work harmony and synergy with regulations that suit the characteristics of each individual employee. Therefore, it is not easy to manage this, the problems that arise often require innovation not only from the management side but also from the employee side. One of the problems raised in this research is turnover. Researchers use the design thinking method to find the best solution. By using design thinking, the process of getting a solution to the problem of high turnover is not always solved with money (big salaries), but it can also be done in other ways, such as maintaining employee mental health and a healthy work environment. This research resulted in the development of an employee mental health program with an employee meditation program before carrying out work

activities. The program testing results showed positive results, employees felt satisfied, which was demonstrated by the activities running well and effectively and producing excellent benefits for employees' mental health.

The suggestion from this research is to develop other programs, either by updating existing programs or by creating other

interesting programs outside of employee mental health. Research can also be more specific on sensitive issues such as salaries and can answer employee needs related to welfare with better company programs when the company's financial condition is also in good condition.

REFERENCE

- Alfatiha, R. A., & Sukoco, I. (2021). Penerapan Metode Design Thinking Terhadap Pemasaran Produk pada Coffee Shop Rimbun. *Bahtera Inovasi*, 5(1), 49-56.
- Belete, A. K. (2018). Turnover intention influencing factors of employees: An empirical work review. *Journal of Entrepreneurship & Organization Management*, 7(3), 1-7.
- Brown, T. (2013). Design Thinking. *Business Review*, 1–11.
- Bussgang, J. (2017). Are you suited for a start-up?. *Harvard Business Review*, 95(6), 152-155.
- Doorley, S., Holcomb, S., Klebahn, P., Segovia, K., & Utley, J. (2018). Bootcamp bootleg.
- Febriansyah, H., & Henndy Ginting, P. (2020). *Tujuh Dimensi employee engagement*. Prenada Media.
- Frian, A., & Mulyani, F. (2018). Millenials employee turnover intention in Indonesia. *Innovative Issues and Approaches in Social Sciences*, 11(3), 90-111.
- Gustiana, R., Hidayat, T., & Fauzi, A. (2022). Pelatihan Dan Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia (Suatu Kajian Literatur Review Ilmu Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia). *Jurnal Ekonomi Manajemen Sistem Informasi*, 3(6), 657-666.
- Iis, E. Y., Wahyuddin, W., Thoyib, A., Ilham, R. N., & Sinta, I. (2022). The Effect of Career Development And Work Environment On Employee Performance With Work Motivation As Intervening Variable At The Office Of Agriculture And Livestock In Aceh. *International Journal of Economic, Business, Accounting, Agriculture Management and Sharia Administration (IJEBS)*, 2(2), 227-236.
- Jha, S. (2009). Determinants of employee turnover intentions: A review. *Management Today*, 9(2).
- Kamuriwo, D. S., Baden-Fuller, C., & Zhang, J. (2017). Knowledge development approaches and breakthrough innovations in technology-based new firms. *Journal of Product Innovation Management*, 34(4), 492-508.
- Kurniawaty, K., Ramly, M., & Ramlawati, R. (2019). The effect of work environment, stress, and job satisfaction on employee turnover intention. *Management science letters*, 9(6), 877-886.
- Madanih, R., Susandi, M., & Zhafira, A. (2019). Penerapan design thinking pada usaha pengembangan budi daya ikan lele di desa pabuaran, kecamatan gunung sindur, Pengaruh Variasi Produk....(Tengku Ismalia Mahira, Nurwani, & Budi Dharma)

- kabupaten bogor. *Baskara: Journal of Business and Entrepreneurship*, 2(1), 55-64.
- Martin, R. L. (2009). *The design of business: Why design thinking is the next competitive advantage*. Harvard Business Press.
- Medina, E. (2012). *Job satisfaction and employee turnover intention: what does organizational culture have to do with it?* (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia university).
- Mobley, W. H. (1986). *Pergantian karyawan: sebab-akibat dan pengendaliannya*. Pustaka Binaman Pressindo.
- Oludayo, A. O., & Omonijo, D. O. (2020). Work-life Balance: Relevance of social support. *Academy of Strategic Management Journal*, 19(3), 1-10.
- Rahayu, N. (2018), 7 Karakteristik Startup.
- Rizqiana, D. I. (2020), Worklife Balance Sebagai Gaya Hidup.
- Robbins, S. P., & Judge, T. A. (2009). *Organizational Behavior 13th Edition* Prentice Hall Publishers.
- Rösch, N., Tiberius, V., & Kraus, S. (2023). Design thinking for innovation: context factors, process, and outcomes. *European Journal of Innovation Management*, 26(7), 160-176.
- Sarjana, S., Kennedy, P. S. J., Silalahi, M., Prameswari, Y., Sayekti, A., Sitaniapessy, R. H., ... & Setyawan, H. (2022). Bunga rampai: jalan menuju organisasi berkelanjutan.
- Schaefer, C. D. (2017). Factors contributing to millennial turnover rates in Department of Defense (DOD) organizations.
- Waldman, J. D., Kelly, F., Aurora, S., & Smith, H. L. (2004). The shocking cost of turnover in health care. *Health care management review*, 29(1), 2-7.
- Winartha, I. M. (2006). *Metodologi penelitian kuantitatif dan kualitatif*. Yogyakarta: Gaha Ilmu.